

# City of Santa Barbara

# ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES DECEMBER 2, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

#### **BOARD MEMBERS:**

Kevin Moore, Chair Bob Cunningham Ivan Insua Leon A. Olson Richard Six David R. Watkins

#### **CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

Jason Dominguez

#### PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

#### STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Moore.

# **ATTENDANCE**

Members present: Moore, Cunningham (at 4:30 p.m.), Insua, Olson (absent 3:48 – 4:30

p.m.), Six, and Watkins (3:46 - 8:16 p.m.)

Members absent: None

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 6:03 p.m.), Ozyilmaz, and Ternovskaya

# **GENERAL BUSINESS**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November** 

18, 2019, as submitted.

Action: Six/Olson, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review Special Joint meeting of

November 18, 2019, as submitted.

Action: Olson/Six, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 2, 2019**, as reviewed by Board

Members Cunningham and Watkins.

Action: Olson/Six, 4/0/0. (Cunningham and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
  - 1. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:
    - a. Board member Watkins will be recusing himself from hearing Item 6, 221 W. Pueblo St.
    - b. Board member Cunningham will be arriving at 4:00 p.m. and will be recusing himself from hearing Item 1, 600 W. Carrillo St. and Item 2, 29 S. Milpas St. due to prior contract work.
  - 2. Ms. Ostrenger announced that the City Attorney's office has hired a new land-use attorney, Greg Lusitana, who will assist the Board when necessary.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

# (3:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

1. 600 W CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-1965
Application Number: PLN2019-00163
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Eric Goodall

(Proposal for pedestrian improvements to Carrillo Street between Bath Street and Miramonte Drive. Project consists of reconstructing the Carrillo Street and San Andres Street pedestrian crossing to reduce the crossing width across Carrillo from 88 feet to 65 feet at the west crossing, and 85 to 56 feet at the eastern crossing. Project includes new pedestrian access ramps for the crossing at San Pascual Street. A total of 29 new light fixtures are proposed to be installed between Bath Street and Miramonte Drive, and one new light fixture is proposed to be installed on Miramonte Drive.)

Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Outdoor Lighting Design Manual. Project was last reviewed on October 21, 2019.

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work with the applicant.

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Eric Goodall, Project Engineer II, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

# Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

- 1. The inclusion of a well thought-out planting plan in areas that are reasonable is appreciated.
- 2. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
  - a. Without any additional comments from Staff, the project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
  - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project. The project uses materials found in other intersections throughout the City.
  - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate as the project consists solely of flatscape.
  - d. There are no adjacent to any Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
  - e. There are no established scenic public vistas.
  - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Six/Olson, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:25 TO 3:48 P.M. \*

#### (3:40PM) REVIEW AFTER FINAL APPROVAL

#### 2. 29 S MILPAS ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-171-024

Zone: C-R

Application Number: PLN2018-00682 Owner: S & P Investments

Applicant: Paul Poirier & Associates Architects

(Proposal for a remodel of an existing commercial shopping center. Project consists of a façade remodel including new colors, copper gutters, sandstone bases, and extended eaves. A new 33 foot tall entry tower is proposed for a new grocery store location. A reallocation of non-residential floor area is proposed with demolition of a 1,697 square foot mezzanine and construction of a 606 square foot loading dock, which results in a demolition credit of 1,091 square feet. Also proposed are changes to parking lot circulation and configuration, new trash enclosure, new bicycle parking, new landscaping and site lighting, and storm water management improvements. Project requires a Minor Zoning Exception for an increase in building height within the north interior setback, a Parking Area Landscape and Fence Standards Waiver, and a Voluntary Lot Merger to merge two adjoining parcels (APNs 017-171-024 and 017-171-004).)

Approval of Review After Final is requested for changes to façade colors, additional metal screening, changes in parking configuration, installation of three new floodlights, and new decorative wall lights. Project was last reviewed on July 8, 2019.

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Olson recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work with the applicant.

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Paul Poirier, Applicant; and Randy Poltl, Owner, S & P Investments

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

#### Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

- 1. The effort that went into improving this shopping center is appreciated.
- 2. The changes to parking configuration are acceptable.
- 3. The landscape planters are acceptable.
- 4. Metal screens over windows are acceptable.
- 5. Decorative wall lights are acceptable.
- 6. The Board is concerned about the proposed building floodlights. They appear tacked on and should be integrated into the design.
- 7. The Board prefers the singular building paint color as previously approved.

Action: Moore/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Cunningham and Olson absent.) Motion carried.

# (4:10PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

#### 3. 16 W MISSION ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-311-014

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2019-00398

Owner: Oliver Fries, 16 W. Mission LLC

Applicant: Heidi Jones

(Proposal for the conversion of an existing commercial complex into a residential complex using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program and the State Bonus Density Law. Project entails an interior conversion of the existing floor area to include a unit mix of nine studio, eleven one-bedroom, and three two-bedroom units ranging in size from 330 square feet and 895 square feet with an average unit size of 520 square feet. The proposed density on this 28,224 square foot lot is 35 dwelling units per acre on a lot with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium High Density Residential which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre, and using the State's Bonus Density Law which allows for up to 11% more units above base density. As part of the State Density Bonus Law, the proposed conversion includes two units designated for "Very Low" income level tenants. Also proposed is a 130 square foot addition.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan and conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density annual residents survey. Project was last reviewed on September 23, 2019.

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.; and John

Beauchamp, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

## **Motion:** Project Design Approval with comments:

- 1. The window types for the new windows, and if possible for the existing aluminum windows, shall be changed to provide a design with mullions, making them more compatible with the existing steel sash windows.
- 2. Applicant shall provide other designs for the screening wall for the trash. The terracotta screen wall should be more sympathetic to style of the existing architecture.
- 3. Final drawings shall show precise areas and solutions to the reduction of the exposed conduit.
- 4. Provide differentiation between the vertical pickets and mesh/cross bars for the stair rails in the center courtyard.
- 5. Provide better screening for the backflow preventer.
- 6. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
  - a. Without any information to the contrary from Staff, the project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
  - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
  - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project do not change and are not applicable.
  - d. The design of the project does not affect Flying "A" Studios located in the adjacent neighborhood as the size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project have not changed.
  - e. The established scenic public vistas are not affected.
  - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping. The landscaping is complimentary to the use of the building and well done.
- 7. The Board makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

# (4:55PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

#### 4. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2019-00192 Owner: Teri Baggao Tuason

Applicant: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal for a second unit on a site currently developed with a single residential unit. Project consists of the addition of a 1,639 square foot, three-story unit to the rear of a 2,454 square foot, two-story residential unit. A two car garage will also be added, with driveway access from Alameda Padre Serra. Project requires a Minor Zoning Exception for an over-height wall within ten feet of the front property line.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires a Minor Zoning Exception. Project was last reviewed on June 3, 2019.

Actual time: 5:12 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Applicant

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

- 1. Victoria Valente, opposed. Bruce Ramsey ceded time to Ms. Valente.
- 2. B.J. Danetra, opposed. Trudi Ramsey ceded time to Ms. Danetra.
- 3. Greg Baker, opposed.

Written correspondence from Victoria Valente was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:38 p.m.

#### **Motion:** Project Design Approval with comments:

- 1. The roof color shall be modified to an approximate terracotta color.
- 2. Replace the existing as-built door on the south elevation to match the door shown on north elevation.
- 3. The windows shall be match those specified on the new addition.
- 4. The sill height on the garage windows shall be raised to five feet.
- 5. The new additions were reduced by 20 inches in height which is appreciated.
- 6. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
  - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
  - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
  - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
  - d. There are no adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
  - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
  - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping. Although landscaping has been reduced, it is still adequate.
- 7. The building shall be painted one color.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 4/2/0. (Watkins and Olson opposed.) Motion carried.

<u>Individual comments:</u> Board Member Watkins stated that it is inappropriate to say that general comments given during conceptual review are binding and cannot be revisited at Project Design Approval.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

#### \* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:18 TO 6:44 P.M. \*

#### (6:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

#### 5. 329 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-392-025

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2019-00040

Owner: Salvador & Maria E. Rodriguez

Applicant: Jan Hochhauser

(Proposal for two new residential duplexes. Project entails the demolition of an existing two-story single residential unit and the construction of two, three-story duplexes. Units will range in size from 2,676 to 3,962 square feet. Also proposed are eight assigned parking spaces, two guest parking spaces, and ten bike parking spaces. Site work includes new landscaping, driveways, courtyards, a pedestrian bridge over the motor court connecting the duplexes, and patios.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on March 11, 2019.

Actual time: 6:48 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Applicant; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 7:06 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

- 1. Shaun Condon
- 2. Victoria Valente, opposed. Greg Baker ceded time to Ms. Valente.

Written correspondence from Victoria Valente, Kim Stevens, Anna Marie Gott, and Phil Condon was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:13 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the project is ready for Project Design Approval? 1/5 Failed

#### Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

- 1. The Board appreciates the thought and consideration put into the project.
- 2. There are concerns about the overall massing of the buildings.
- 3. Implement design strategies at the roof and revise glazing sizes to reduce the overall apparent mass of the project.
- 4. Applicant shall further define materials where they occur throughout the project.
- 5. Revise the proposed mechanical yards to better screen equipment.
- 6. If rooftop equipment units are used, provide a preliminary plan for the proposed equipment and its position, and show a 36" minimum parapet height for rooftop equipment wells.
- 7. Provide an Arborist report for the Camphor tree in the front yard.
- 8. Applicant shall look at the View Ordinance and check whether the palm trees species selected will not pose potential issues to neighbors.
- 9. Refine design elements of the bridge to provide more detailing consistent with overall project.
- 10. Pull back the perimeter retaining walls where possible to ensure the health of the existing hedge.
- 11. Provide a lighting plan
- 12. Provide typical door and window details and specify materials.

Action: Watkins/Six, 5/0/1. (Olson abstained.) Motion carried.

# (7:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

# 6. 221 W PUEBLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-181-029

Zone: O-M

Application Number: PLN2019-00549

Owner: Ranchero Properties, LLC

Applicant: George Mansour

(Proposal for a commercial remodel. Project entails a 144 square foot addition to the first floor lobby, resurfacing of all exterior façades either with plaster or repaired wood siding, demolition of an exterior stair, Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) improvements, and changes to hardscape and landscaping. A parking space is proposed to be replaced with two new parking spaces.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Watkins recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work.

Actual time: 8:16 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields, DesignARC; George Mansour, DesignARC; Kim True, Landscape

Architect; and Tom Sanborn, Owner

Public comment opened at 8:33 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

# Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

- 1. The Board gives the project positive comments.
- 2. Provide more information on the screening elements.
- 3. Relate the planter retaining wall material to the neighborhood.
- 4. Maintain proposed trees and add additional evergreen trees in parking lot.
- 5. Consider removing the Mexican fan palm in the front yard.
- 6. The colors as proposed in print form are acceptable.
- 7. Provide color swatches of plaster colors.
- 8. The mechanical screens shall be sympathetic to materials used.
- 9. Refine the locations and design of horizontal sun screens on the roof.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 5/0/0. (Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:07 P.M. \*